From edmac to reledmac and reledpar

History and expectations for critical editions with LaTeX

Maïeul Rouquette

Université de Lausanne — IRSB

5th april 2018 — Dante e.V. meeting

1. What is a critical edition?

2. From edmac to ledmac and ledpar

3. From ledmac and ledpar to reledmac and reledpar

4. Summary of six years of work (2017/03/09)

5. Limits et expectations

Section 1

What is a critical edition?

A text is kept to us

- In one witness with reading difficulties

A text is kept to us

- In one witness with reading difficulties
  - Material conservation (fire, humidity, etc.)

A text is kept to us

- ▶ In one witness with reading difficulties
  - ▶ Material conservation (fire, humidity, etc.)
  - ▶ Palaeographical problems

A text is kept to us

- ▶ In one witness with reading difficulties
  - ▶ Material conservation (fire, humidity, etc.)
  - ▶ Palaeographical problems
  - ▶ Corrections (e. g. writer draft)

A text is kept to us

- ▶ In one witness with reading difficulties
    - ▶ Material conservation (fire, humidity, etc.)
    - ▶ Palaeographical problems
    - ▶ Corrections (e. g. writer draft)
- ▶ In many witnesses with divergences

A text is kept to us

- In one witness with reading difficulties
  - Material conservation (fire, humidity, etc.)
  - Palaeographical problems
  - Corrections (e. g. writer draft)
- In many witnesses with divergences
  - (Un)voluntary changes when copying a work from Antiquity or Middle Age

A text is kept to us

- ▶ In one witness with reading difficulties
  - ▶ Material conservation (fire, humidity, etc.)
  - ▶ Palaeographical problems
  - ▶ Corrections (e. g. writer draft)
- ▶ In many witnesses with divergences
  - ▶ (Un)voluntary changes when copying a work from Antiquity or Middle Age
  - ▶ Many drafts for the same works (for modern writers)

A text is kept to us

- ▶ In one witness with reading difficulties
  - ▶ Material conservation (fire, humidity, etc.)
  - ▶ Palaeographical problems
  - ▶ Corrections (e. g. writer draft)
- ▶ In many witnesses with divergences
  - ▶ (Un)voluntary changes when copying a work from Antiquity or Middle Age
  - ▶ Many drafts for the same works (for modern writers)
  - ▶ For books after the invention of printing, divergences between the different prints (e.g. a novel published in a newspaper thereafter in a book)

Function of the editor

- Analyze the witnesses of the text

Function of the editor

- Analyze the witnesses of the text
- Compare them et find their mutual relationships

Function of the editor

- Analyze the witnesses of the text
- Compare them et find their mutual relationships
- Determine an edition of the text

Function of the editor

- Analyze the witnesses of the text
- Compare them et find their mutual relationships
- Determine an edition of the text
  - From one basis witness, with (maybe) some corrections

Function of the editor

- Analyze the witnesses of the text
- Compare them et find their mutual relationships
- Determine an edition of the text
  - From one basis witness, with (maybe) some corrections
  - From many witnesses ("eclectic edition")

Function of the editor

- Analyze the witnesses of the text
- Compare them et find their mutual relationships
- Determine an edition of the text
    - From one basis witness, with (maybe) some corrections
    - From many witnesses ("eclectic edition")
- Maybe, do normalization (mainly orthographic)

Around the edited text

- ▶ An introduction, which justifies the choices of the editor

Around the edited text

- An introduction, which justifies the choices of the editor
- A *textual apparatus* showing

Around the edited text

- An introduction, which justifies the choices of the editor
- A *textual apparatus* showing
  - The corrections or the proposals of correction from the editor

Around the edited text

- An introduction, which justifies the choices of the editor
- A *textual apparatus* showing
  - The corrections or the proposals of correction from the editor
  - The main textual variations

Around the edited text

- An introduction, which justifies the choices of the editor
- A *textual apparatus* showing
  - The corrections or the proposals of correction from the editor
  - The main textual variations
  - The problem of witnesses reading

Around the edited text

- An introduction, which justifies the choices of the editor
- A *textual apparatus* showing
    - The corrections or the proposals of correction from the editor
    - The main textual variations
    - The problem of witnesses reading
    - All needed remarks about the transmission of a precise part of the text (e.g. corrections in a manuscript)

Frequent complements to a critical edition

▶ *Sources apparatus*

Frequent complements to a critical edition

- *Sources apparatus*
- Notes about history or philology

Frequent complements to a critical edition

- *Sources apparatus*
- Notes about history or philology
- Translation in a modern language

Frequent complements to a critical edition

- *Sources apparatus*
- Notes about history or philology
- Translation in a modern language
- One or more index

Frequent complements to a critical edition

- *Sources apparatus*
- Notes about history or philology
- Translation in a modern language
- One or more index
- Commentary

Frequent complements to a critical edition

- *Sources apparatus*
- Notes about history or philology
- Translation in a modern language
- One or more index
- Commentary
- Bibliography

Typographical consequences

- Need many layers for the footnotes or endnotes

Typographical consequences

▶ Need many layers for the footnotes or endnotes
▶ Need notes which refer to one (or more) word on a page, on a precise line

Typographical consequences

- ▶ Need many layers for the footnotes or endnotes
- ▶ Need notes which refer to one (or more) word on a page, on a precise line
- ▶ Need, sometime, to have a translation in parallel

(Fictional) example

1   The little cat died. It failed from the tower. Why is it
2   always a little cat that dies and never a pope that fails
3   from the tower?

---

1 cat] A: dog   1 died] B: passed away   2 always] C: *om.*   3 tower] AD: *add.* to the street

Section 2

From edmac to ledmac and ledpar

edmac

- For PlainTeX

edmac

- For PlainTeX
- John Lavignino and Dominik Wujastyk (1988-1989)

edmac

- For PlainTeX
- John Lavignino and Dominik Wujastyk (1988-1989)
- Establish the bases

edmac

- For PlainTeX
- John Lavignino and Dominik Wujastyk (1988-1989)
- Establish the bases
  - Lines numbering (with configuration)

edmac

- For PlainTeX
- John Lavignino and Dominik Wujastyk (1988-1989)
- Establish the bases
    - Lines numbering (with configuration)
    - Critical notes on multiple layers

edmac

- ▶ For PlainTₑX
- ▶ John Lavignino and Dominik Wujastyk (1988-1989)
- ▶ Establish the bases
  - ▶ Lines numbering (with configuration)
  - ▶ Critical notes on multiple layers
- ▶ In 1994, thirteen works published with edmac

edmac

code 1: Minimal example with edmac

```
1  \beginnumbering
2  \pstart
3  \text{lemma}\Afootnote{note}\
4  \pend
5  \endnumbering
```

edmac

code 1: Minimal example with edmac

```
1  \beginnumbering
2  \pstart
3  \text{lemma}\Afootnote{note}\
4  \pend
5  \endnumbering
```

⇒ The basis is here

edmac

code 1: Minimal example with edmac

```
1  \beginnumbering
2  \pstart
3  \text{lemma}\Afootnote{note}\
4  \pend
5  \endnumbering
```

⇒ The basis is here
⇒ Later, completed by edstanza (poetry) and edtab (tables), also for PlainTEX

ledmac

- ▶ 2003: Peter Wilson ports edmac and related to LaTeX ⇒ ledmac

ledmac

- 2003: Peter Wilson ports **edmac** and related to LaTeX ⇒ **ledmac**
- "A presumptuous attempt to port EDMAC, TABMAC and EDSTANZA to LaTeX"

ledmac

- 2003: Peter Wilson ports **edmac** and related to $\LaTeX$ $\Rightarrow$ **ledmac**
- "A presumptuous attempt to port EDMAC, TABMAC and EDSTANZA to LaTeX"
- I did never understand this subtitle

ledmac

- Loaded as a package with \usepackage

ledmac

- Loaded as a package with `\usepackage`
- Uses a LaTeX syntax for the commands (argument delimitation)

ledmac

- ▶ Loaded as a package with `\usepackage`
- ▶ Uses a LaTeX syntax for the commands (argument delimitation)
- ▶ Solves name conflicts (`\label`→`\edlabel`)

ledmac

- ▶ Loaded as a package with `\usepackage`
- ▶ Uses a LaTeX syntax for the commands (argument delimitation)
- ▶ Solves name conflicts (`\label`→`\edlabel`)
- ▶ Adds tools for indexation

ledmac

- Loaded as a package with `\usepackage`
- Uses a LaTeX syntax for the commands (argument delimitation)
- Solves name conflicts (`\label`→`\edlabel`)
- Adds tools for indexation
- Adds "familiar" footnotes (with footnote mark) on multiple layers

ledmac

code 2: Minimal example with ledmac

```
1  \beginnumbering
2  \pstart
3  \edtext{lemma}{\Afootnote{note}}
4  \pend
5  \endnumbering
```

ledpar

- 2004: Peter Wilson creates ledpar

ledpar

- 2004: Peter Wilson creates ledpar
- Allows to typeset two critical texts in parallel

ledpar

- 2004: Peter Wilson creates ledpar
- Allows to typeset two critical texts in parallel
  - Two columns in parallel

ledpar

- 2004: Peter Wilson creates ledpar
- Allows to typeset two critical texts in parallel
    - Two columns in parallel
    - Two pages in parallel

ledpar

- 2004: Peter Wilson creates ledpar
- Allows to typeset two critical texts in parallel
  - Two columns in parallel
  - Two pages in parallel
- Most frequent case: a text with its translation

ledpar

code 3: Example of ledpar use

```latex
\begin{pages}
  \begin{Leftside}
    \beginnumbering
    \pstart
    A left page.
    The paragraph is longer than on the right page.
    The package will do the synchronization.
    \pend
    \pstart
    An other paragraph on the left side.
    \pend
    \endnumbering
  \end{Leftside}
  \begin{Rightside}
    \beginnumbering
    \pstart
    A paragraph on the right side.
    \pend
    \pstart
    An other paragraph on the right side.
    \pend
    \endnumbering
  \end{Rightside}
\end{pages}
\Pages
```

ledarab

- ▶ 2003: Peter Wilson creates ledarab

ledarab

- 2003: Peter Wilson creates ledarab
- Is based on arabtex, but is compatible with ledmac features

Section 3

From ledmac and ledpar to reledmac and reledpar

How I became the maintainers of ledmac and ledpar

- ▶ 2003-2005: Peter Wilson maintains ledmac / ledpar

How I became the maintainers of ledmac and ledpar

▶ 2003-2005: Peter Wilson maintains ledmac / ledpar
▶ On the web, we find some hacks to adapt ledmac / ledpar to specific needs

How I became the maintainers of ledmac and ledpar

- ▶ 2003-2005: Peter Wilson maintains ledmac / ledpar
- ▶ On the web, we find some hacks to adapt ledmac / ledpar to specific needs
- ▶ In 2011, a relative speaks to me about one of these hacks

How I became the maintainers of ledmac and ledpar

- ▶ 2003-2005: Peter Wilson maintains ledmac / ledpar
- ▶ On the web, we find some hacks to adapt ledmac / ledpar to specific needs
- ▶ In 2011, a relative speaks to me about one of these hacks
- ▶ I integrate it to ledpar

How I became the maintainers of ledmac and ledpar

- 2003-2005: Peter Wilson maintains ledmac / ledpar
- On the web, we find some hacks to adapt ledmac / ledpar to specific needs
- In 2011, a relative speaks to me about one of these hacks
- I integrate it to ledpar
- I propose it to the CTAN

How I became the maintainers of ledmac and ledpar

- ▶ 2003-2005: Peter Wilson maintains ledmac / ledpar
- ▶ On the web, we find some hacks to adapt ledmac / ledpar to specific needs
- ▶ In 2011, a relative speaks to me about one of these hacks
- ▶ I integrate it to ledpar
- ▶ I propose it to the CTAN
- ⇒ I discover the LPPL and the maintainer system

Maintainer work

1. I open a Github repository

Maintainer work

1. I open a Github repository
2. Many asks are send to me

Maintainer work

1. I open a Github repository
2. Many asks are send to me
3. In particular, some asks to easily customize the note displaying

eledmac and eledpar

- In 2012, I see some problems

eledmac and eledpar

- In 2012, I see some problems
  - Redundant code in ledmac (note layers)

eledmac and eledpar

- In 2012, I see some problems
  - Redundant code in ledmac (note layers)
  - Hacks to customize displaying

eledmac and eledpar

- In 2012, I see some problems
  - Redundant code in ledmac (note layers)
  - Hacks to customize displaying
    - Complex to be understood by users

eledmac and eledpar

- In 2012, I see some problems
  - Redundant code in ledmac (note layers)
  - Hacks to customize displaying
    - Complex to be understood by users
    - Many time, not mutually compatible

eledmac and eledpar

- In 2012, I see some problems
  - Redundant code in ledmac (note layers)
  - Hacks to customize displaying
    - Complex to be understood by users
    - Many time, not mutually compatible
- ⇒ Add some entrance points to the commands, called "hooks"

eledmac and eledpar

- In 2012, I see some problems
  - Redundant code in ledmac (note layers)
  - Hacks to customize displaying
    - Complex to be understood by users
    - Many time, not mutually compatible
- ⇒ Add some entrance points to the commands, called "hooks"
- ⇒ The hooks can be easily configured in the preamble

eledmac and eledpar

code 4: Example of hooks with eledmac

```
1  \numberonlyfirstinline%On the footnote, typeset
   ↪   the line number only if it is the first note for
   ↪   this line
2  \symlinenum{$||$}%Double pipe if we don't typeset
   ↪   the line number
```

1   The little cat died. It failed from the tower. Why is it
2   always a little cat that dies and never a pope that fails
3   from the tower?

---

1 cat] A: dog || died] B: passed away   2 always] C: *om.*   3
tower] AD: *add.* to the street

eledmac and eledpar

- ▶ Users don't need anymore to override low level commands ("internal")

eledmac and eledpar

- Users don't need anymore to override low level commands ("internal")
- But I need to add an argument to these commands, in order to allow to configure the hooks depending of note layer

eledmac and eledpar

▶ Users don't need anymore to override low level commands ("internal")

▶ But I need to add an argument to these commands, in order to allow to configure the hooks depending of note layer

⇒ It breaks the compatibility for the people who modified the commands

eledmac and eledpar

- ▶ Users don't need anymore to override low level commands ("internal")
- ▶ But I need to add an argument to these commands, in order to allow to configure the hooks depending of note layer
- ⇒ It breaks the compatibility for the people who modified the commands
- ⇒ Need to change the name in order to avoid problem when upgrading TₑX distributions

eledmac and eledpar

- eledmac and eledpar

eledmac and eledpar

- eledmac and eledpar
- "e" for "extended"...

eledmac and eledpar

- eledmac and eledpar
- "e" for "extended"...
- ... but also for etoolbox

eledmac and eledpar

- Stop maintaining ledarab

eledmac and eledpar

- Stop maintaining ledarab
- Writings from right to left must be managed by modern engines: X∃TEX or LuaTEX

reledmac and reledpar

- ▶ More and more hooks, which names are, sometime, not consistent

reledmac and reledpar

- ▶ More and more hooks, which names are, sometime, not consistent
- ▶ Sometime, settings are made with command call, sometime whith command redefinition (`\renewcommand`)

reledmac and reledpar

- ▶ More and more hooks, which names are, sometime, not consistent
- ▶ Sometime, settings are made with command call, sometime whith command redefinition (\renewcommand)
- ▶ Some commands defined in eledmac are redefined in eledpar (\renewcommand) ⇒ More risks of error

reledmac and reledpar

- More and more hooks, which names are, sometime, not consistent
- Sometime, settings are made with command call, sometime whith command redefinition (`\renewcommand`)
- Some commands defined in eledmac are redefined in eledpar (`\renewcommand`) ⇒ More risks of error
- The output routine (`\output`) is overwritten and not patched ⇒More risks of incompatibility

reledmac and reledpar

- Rereading all the code

reledmac and reledpar

- Rereading all the code
- Using patching commands of etoolbox

reledmac and reledpar

- Rereading all the code
- Using patching commands of etoolbox
- Defining a naming convention for the hooks

reledmac and reledpar

- Rereading all the code
- Using patching commands of etoolbox
- Defining a naming convention for the hooks
  Name starting with X applicable to the critical footnotes

reledmac and reledpar

- ▶ Rereading all the code
- ▶ Using patching commands of etoolbox
- ▶ Defining a naming convention for the hooks
  Name starting with X applicable to the critical footnotes
  Name ending with X applicable to the familiar footnotes

reledmac and reledpar

- ▶ Rereading all the code
- ▶ Using patching commands of etoolbox
- ▶ Defining a naming convention for the hooks

  Name starting with X applicable to the critical footnotes
  Name ending with X applicable to the familiar footnotes
  Name starting with Xend applicable the critical endnotes

reledmac and reledpar

- Rereading all the code
- Using patching commands of etoolbox
- Defining a naming convention for the hooks

  Name starting with X applicable to the critical footnotes
  Name ending with X applicable to the familiar footnotes
  Name starting with Xend applicable the critical endnotes
- reledmac and reledpar: "r" as renewed

Section 4

Summary of six years of work (2017/03/09)

Statistics

▶ More than six hundred improvements / fixed bugs

Statistics

- ▶ More than six hundred improvements / fixed bugs
- ▶ More than two hundred releases

Statistics

- ► More than six hundred improvements / fixed bugs
- ► More than two hundred releases
- ► More than eight thousand commits

Main improvements

- Documentation

Main improvements

- Documentation
  - Make clear distinction between

Main improvements

▶ Documentation
  ▶ Make clear distinction between
    ▶ The documentation of the user interface

Main improvements

- Documentation
    - Make clear distinction between
        - The documentation of the user interface
        - The documentation of the code

Main improvements

- Documentation
  - Make clear distinction between
    - The documentation of the user interface
    - The documentation of the code
    - The examples

Main improvements

- Documentation
  - Make clear distinction between
    - The documentation of the user interface
    - The documentation of the code
    - The examples
  - Add sectioning and use hyperref

Main improvements

- Documentation
  - Make clear distinction between
    - The documentation of the user interface
    - The documentation of the code
    - The examples
  - Add sectioning and use hyperref
- More explicit error messages when an user makes syntax errors

Main improvements

▶ One hundred thirty-seven hooks

Main improvements

- One hundred thirty-seven hooks
- Sectioning management (`\section` etc.)

Main improvements

- One hundred thirty-seven hooks
- Sectioning management (`\section` etc.)
- Better cohesion between reledmac and reledpar

Main improvements

- ▶ One hundred thirty-seven hooks
- ▶ Sectioning management (`\section` etc.)
- ▶ Better cohesion between reledmac and reledpar
- ▶ New synchronization options for reledpar

Main improvements

- One hundred thirty-seven hooks
- Sectioning management (`\section` etc.)
- Better cohesion between reledmac and reledpar
- New synchronization options for reledpar
- Management of the ambiguous lemmas (if we have many time the same word in the same line)

Main improvements

- One hundred thirty-seven hooks
- Sectioning management (`\section` etc.)
- Better cohesion between reledmac and reledpar
- New synchronization options for reledpar
- Management of the ambiguous lemmas (if we have many time the same word in the same line)
- Options to not load some features if not needed

Main improvements

- One hundred thirty-seven hooks
- Sectioning management (`\section` etc.)
- Better cohesion between reledmac and reledpar
- New synchronization options for reledpar
- Management of the ambiguous lemmas (if we have many time the same word in the same line)
- Options to not load some features if not needed
- Better compatibility with some packages

Main improvements

- One hundred thirty-seven hooks
- Sectioning management (`\section` etc.)
- Better cohesion between reledmac and reledpar
- New synchronization options for reledpar
- Management of the ambiguous lemmas (if we have many time the same word in the same line)
- Options to not load some features if not needed
- Better compatibility with some packages
- ...

Section 5

Limits et expectations

Personal limits

- Time limits (unsalaried work)

Personal limits

- Time limits (unsalaried work)
- English is not my native language

Personal limits

- Time limits (unsalaried work)
- English is not my native language
- No knowledge of some subtleties of modern engines for right-to-left writing

Complexities linked to reledmac/reledpar working

- Split paragraphs to lines with \vsplit ⇒ Problem with texts "outer of a classical paragraph" (titles, lists, images, etc.)

Complexities linked to reledmac/reledpar working

▶ Split paragraphs to lines with \vsplit ⇒ Problem with texts "outer of a classical paragraph" (titles, lists, images, etc.)

▶ Shift between the time a text is read by TₑX and the time it is typeset (especially reledpar) ⇒ Constant vigilance!

Technical debt with reledpar

- ▶ Asymmetry between the internal commands for the left text and for the right text

Technical debt with reledpar

- ▶ Asymmetry between the internal commands for the left text and for the right text
  - ▶ Some commands for the left text apply also in the mode "single text/single column"

Technical debt with reledpar

- ▶ Asymmetry between the internal commands for the left text and for the right text
  - ▶ Some commands for the left text apply also in the mode "single text/single column"
  - ▶ But the commands for the right text apply only the right text

Technical debt with reledpar

- ▶ Asymmetry between the internal commands for the left text and for the right text
  - ▶ Some commands for the left text apply also in the mode "single text/single column"
  - ▶ But the commands for the right text apply only the right text
- ▶ Code duplication between internal left commands and internal right commands

Technical debt with reledpar

▶ Asymmetry between the internal commands for the left text and for the right text
  ▶ Some commands for the left text apply also in the mode "single text/single column"
  ▶ But the commands for the right text apply only the right text
▶ Code duplication between internal left commands and internal right commands
▶ Binary conception for parallel typesetting $\Rightarrow$ Impossible to expect to typeset three or more texts in parallel without rewriting around 90 % of the code

Wishes

- Continue to make "easy" improvements as regularly as possible

Wishes

- Continue to make "easy" improvements as regularly as possible
- Create figures to explain internal working of reledmac / reledpar

Wishes

- ▶ Continue to make "easy" improvements as regularly as possible
- ▶ Create figures to explain internal working of reledmac / reledpar
- ▶ Create more and more MWE in order to avoid involuntary compatibility breaks

Wishes

- ▶ Continue to make "easy" improvements as regularly as possible
- ▶ Create figures to explain internal working of reledmac / reledpar
- ▶ Create more and more MWE in order to avoid involuntary compatibility breaks
- ▶ Imply more the users in the project

Wishes

▶ Continue to make "easy" improvements as regularly as possible

▶ Create figures to explain internal working of reledmac / reledpar

▶ Create more and more MWE in order to avoid involuntary compatibility breaks

▶ Imply more the users in the project
  ▶ Documentation

Wishes

- ▶ Continue to make "easy" improvements as regularly as possible
- ▶ Create figures to explain internal working of reledmac / reledpar
- ▶ Create more and more MWE in order to avoid involuntary compatibility breaks
- ▶ Imply more the users in the project
  - ▶ Documentation
  - ▶ Examples

Wishes

▶ Continue to make "easy" improvements as regularly as possible

▶ Create figures to explain internal working of reledmac / reledpar

▶ Create more and more MWE in order to avoid involuntary compatibility breaks

▶ Imply more the users in the project
   ▶ Documentation
   ▶ Examples
   ▶ Easy problems to solve (?)

Wishes

- Continue to make "easy" improvements as regularly as possible
- Create figures to explain internal working of reledmac / reledpar
- Create more and more MWE in order to avoid involuntary compatibility breaks
- Imply more the users in the project
  - Documentation
  - Examples
  - Easy problems to solve (?)
- Find a founding for one year after my actual contract in order to improve parallel typesetting

Thank you very much to DANTE !